

CITY OF SAN JOSÉ, CALIFORNIA Department of Planning, Building and Code Enforcement 801 North First Street, Room 400 San José, California 95110-1795	Hearing Date/Agenda Number H.L.C. 5/7/03 Item 6.b.
<h1 style="margin: 0;">STAFF REPORT</h1>	File Number PDC 01-08-082
	Application Type Planned Development Prezoning and Rezoning
	Council District 5
	Planning Area Alum Rock
	Assessor's Parcel Number(s) 601-09-013, 601-09-106, 601-09-011, 601-09-023

PROJECT DESCRIPTION	Completed by: Jenny Nusbaum
Location: West side of Alum Rock Avenue approximately 200 feet northerly of Marian Lane (4600, 4601, and 4609 Hyland Avenue and 4609 Alum Rock Avenue)	
Gross Acreage: 8.21	Net Acreage: 8.21 Net Density: n/a
Existing Zoning: A-Agricultural, Unincorporated County	Existing Use: Religious assembly and school uses
Proposed Zoning: A(PD) Planned Development	Proposed Use: Expanded religious assembly and school uses

GENERAL PLAN	Completed by: JN
Land Use/Transportation Diagram Designation Public/Quasi-Public	Project Conformance: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> See Analysis and Recommendations

SURROUNDING LAND USES AND ZONING	Completed by: JN
North: Residential	R-1-8 Residence and Unincorporated County
East: Residential	Unincorporated County
South: Residential	Unincorporated County
West: Residential	R-1-8 Residence and Unincorporated County

ENVIRONMENTAL STATUS	Completed by: JN
<input type="checkbox"/> Environmental Impact Report certified <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Negative Declaration circulated on April 22, 2003 <input type="checkbox"/> Negative Declaration adopted on	<input type="checkbox"/> Exempt <input type="checkbox"/> Environmental Review Incomplete

FILE HISTORY	Completed by: JN
Annexation Title: McKee No. 91	Date: 05/26/1978

PLANNING DEPARTMENT RECOMMENDATIONS AND ACTION		
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Approval <input type="checkbox"/> Approval with Conditions <input type="checkbox"/> Denial	Date: _____	Approved by: _____ <input type="checkbox"/> Action <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Recommendation

APPLICANT/OWNER	DEVELOPER
Roman Catholic Welfare Corp. of San Jose and Roman Catholic Bishop of San Jose Attn: Michael J. Mitchell 900 Lafayette Street Santa Clara, CA 95050	

BACKGROUND

The applicant, the Roman Catholic Welfare Corporation of San Jose and Roman Catholic Bishop of San Jose, is proposing to pre-zone and rezone property to allow an expansion to an existing religious assembly and school complex. The project is located at the westerly side of Alum Rock Avenue approximately 200 feet northerly of Marian Lane (4600, 4601, and 4609 Hyland Avenue, and 4609 Alum Rock Avenue) on an 8.21 gross acre site.

As it exists today, the St. John Vianney Church complex includes seven primary structures and one accessory building (a detached garage) located on two blocks between Madeline Drive and Alum Rock Avenue. The primary structures consist of a church sanctuary building, a pavilion, a kindergarten building, a main school building, an administrative office building, a fellowship hall (activity center), and a rectory (formerly a private house). The church sanctuary building fronts on to the west side of Hyland Avenue. The pavilion and kindergarten are to the rear of the site, west of the church sanctuary. The main school building is located to the south of the church sanctuary, across a courtyard from the previously mentioned structures, at 4601 Hyland Avenue. The church office building is located to the east and across the street from the school at 4600 Hyland Avenue. The fellowship hall, garage, and rectory are east of the church office building. The rectory fronts on to the west side of Alum Rock Avenue.

Four parcels comprise the subject site. One of the parcels, consisting of approximately 3.41 acres located on the west side of Hyland Avenue, is currently in the A-Agricultural zoning district. The other three parcels, consisting of approximately 4.8 acres, are currently unincorporated in the County. These three parcels are part of a proposed annexation named McKee No. 120. All four parcels are included in the subject Planned Development Zoning application PDC 01-08-082.

A Planned Development zoning district and Planned Development permit are required to allow development of the project, as proposed. The City Council, through the Planned Development zoning, will establish allowable uses, development standards, and regulations, including height limits, setbacks, parking requirements, and environmental mitigation specific to the proposed project. The Planned Development (PD) permit for final architectural design, based upon the proposed Planned Development zoning district's standards, will be processed by Planning staff who will bring the more detailed PD permit plans before the Historic Landmarks Commission prior to the Planning Director's hearing on the permit.

The proposed project and the existing complex were evaluated in a report entitled, "Historic Evaluation of St. John Vianney Church Complex at 4600 Hyland Avenue in the City of San Jose," by Archaeological Resource Management, dated January 16, 2003 (attached). According to the Historic Evaluation, most of the structures are built in the Spanish Colonial Revival style including the church sanctuary building, the church office building, the main school building, and the rectory. The structures were built at various dates from the 1920s to 1969 as follows: the rectory in the 1920s; the church sanctuary building in 1952; the main school building in 1954, with a second wing added in 1957; and the office building, originally built as a convent in 1969, then converted into Parish offices. The main part of St. Francis Hall, a fellowship hall that currently serves as an activity center, was probably constructed sometime in the 1920s. At a later undetermined date, a modern wooden addition was attached to the front of the structure. A kindergarten building and barbecue pavilion were also added to the complex at unknown later

dates. The small kindergarten school expansion was not built in the Spanish Colonial Revival style.

The proposed one- and two-story project would incorporate both new construction, remodeling, and demolition. All existing and proposed buildings are stucco. Under the proposed scope, the complex would include a remodeled two-story church sanctuary, a new two-story school addition to the existing one-story kindergarten building, classroom additions to the existing one-story main school building, a new two-story parish center containing a multi-purpose room (gymnasium/auditorium), the existing two-story office building, the existing two-story rectory building, the existing one-story garage, a new landscaped courtyard, and existing, renovated, and new outdoor parking and recreation areas. The project would demolish the fellowship hall and the cinderblock pavilion, neither of which is historically significant. It would also remove approximately seven ordinance size trees and seventeen non-ordinance size trees. New landscaping would be installed throughout the site, including trees, shrubbery, groundcover, vines, walkways, benches, and tables.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

The environmental impacts of this project were addressed by a Mitigated Negative Declaration with a circulation beginning on April 22, 2003, and ending on May 12, 2003. The Initial Study for the Mitigated Negative Declaration concluded that, if the remodeled and new structures are designed in a manner that is consistent with the architectural style of the existing structures, the project will have less than significant impacts to historic resources on the subject site.

GENERAL PLAN CONFORMANCE

The proposal is consistent with the San Jose 2020 General Plan Land Use/Transportation designation of Public/Quasi-Public. This designation allows religious assembly buildings and schools.

ANALYSIS

The primary historic project issue is the relationship between the existing church complex and the new construction proposed for the site.

Existing Church Complex

As noted in the Historic Evaluation, the Saint John Vianney Church complex is not currently listed on the City of San Jose's Historic Resource Inventory, the National Register of Historic Places, the California Register of Historic Resources, or any local listing of historic resources. According to the Historic Evaluation, the complex does not appear to be eligible for either the National Register or the California Register.

The church complex as a whole received a point score of 47.8 on the City of San Jose's Historic Resource Evaluation. This score identifies the complex as a "Structure of Merit." The City of San

Jose defines a Structure of Merit as “a structure determined to be a resource through evaluation by the Historic Landmarks Commission’s Historic Evaluation Criteria” and a structure for “which preservation should be a high priority.” However, neither of the structures scheduled for demolition, the fellowship hall and the cinderblock pavilion, contribute to the historical significance of the church complex. The Historic Evaluation concludes that, “the complex as a whole does retain its integrity in location, setting, design, and feeling. The materials and workmanship are not especially notable, and research revealed no associations with persons or events contributing to broad patterns of history.”

The Historic Evaluation of St. John Vianney church complex focused on the structures that could be impacted by the project and their contribution to the historic fabric of the City of San Jose and the County of Santa Clara. The Evaluation describes the context leading to the construction of the church sanctuary building, and the subsequent evolution of the church complex, as follows:

“After World War II, a nationwide wave of new construction of Roman Catholic churches resulted in at least five additional parishes between 1951 and 1966. St. John Vianney was opened to serve the Alum Rock area in 1952. The architects for the sanctuary structure were Vincent Buckley and Fred Houweling, and the builder was D.J. Sunseri Builders. The building was meant to be temporary and was to become the fellowship hall, and the permanent sanctuary was to be built in the location of the house fronting Alum Rock Avenue. Funding problems prevented the construction of the second building. Part of the original altar has been installed at the back of the sanctuary.

The church itself was constructed in 1952 in the Spanish Colonial Revival style. It is laid out in Christian Basilica format, beginning with the narthex, then a long nave leading to the apse with a centrally placed altar. The building is of wooden frame construction and covered with stucco, painted white. The roof has a shallow pitch, is front-gabled, and is surfaced with Spanish roof tile. At the peak of the roof is a Latin cross. The front façade is dominated by a large, arched entryway and two smaller flanking doors. Above the entryway is a frieze in a stylized vegetal pattern, with a centrally placed crest bearing the chi-rho (this Christian symbol is composed of the Greek letters chi and rho, the first two letters in the word “Christ” in Greek.) Above this is an arched stained glass window with an ornamental casement. With the exception of the front façade, the exterior of the building is relatively plain, the only decoration being the stained glass windows along the sides.

The wooden double doors of the entryway lead into the narthex. An archway to the north leads to a stairway to the choir loft. A matching archway on the southern side leads to a small side room closed off by a decorative wrought-iron gate. Three sets of wooden double doors allow entry into the nave. The ceiling of the nave is supported by wooden truss beams in the king-post arrangement. The nave has one large central aisle, and two smaller aisles along the transepts. Each wall along the transept has five large arched and one small circular stained glass window. These windows are highly decorative and are of significant artistic merit. Along the north wall, leading from the entry towards the altar, the windows depict Saint Vincent de Paul, Father Junipero Serra, Saint John Vianney, Saint Clare, Saint Anthony of Padua, and a rosary window. Following the south wall, again from the entryway towards the apse, the windows depict Saint Theresa of Avila, Saint Joseph, the Annunciation, Saint Peter, Saint Paul the Apostle, and a prayer window.

Along the north wall also are located several confessional booths. In the apse are the main altar and two smaller, flanking altars: a tabernacle is on the left, and Our Lady stands in another niche under a decorative canopy. Behind the main altar and under a baldachino hangs a carved wooden crucifix. Overall the structure is in good condition.

The earliest portion of the school was constructed in 1954, and a second wing was added in 1957. Like the majority of the other structures in the complex, the school is also built in the Spanish Colonial Revival style. The roof is covered with Spanish roof tile. Above the entryway is an ornamental peak, surmounted by a Latin cross. Six steps lead up to the entry door, which is of wood and glass panes, with a segmental arch. On either side of the entry door is a bank of windows, shaded by small canopies. The rear of the building echoes the front without ornamentation: entry doors flanked by glass windows shaded by canopies. Inside, the classrooms are floored in linoleum and ceilings are acoustic tile. In addition to the original school structure, there is a smaller school expansion with an attached kindergarten and playground. Overall, the structures are in good condition.

The pavilion between the church building and the kindergarten building is located beside a spit barbecue with a corrugated metal canopy. The building is completely open along the sides, concrete-floored, and has small enclosed areas at each end. The walls of the enclosed areas are of cinder block, and the low-pitched gabled roof is covered with composite shingles.

The Parish offices building was originally built in 1969 as a convent for nuns working at the school. Later, the structure was converted into Parish offices, as it remains today. This structure is also Spanish Colonial Revival style, and bears a Latin cross over the chapel portion. There is a second floor balcony along the front of the building, secured by a high stucco wall or a wrought-iron rail. Five steps lead up from ground level to the paneled wooden entry door with decorative glass to either side.

The chapel in the Parish offices was originally built for the sisters in the convent. The pews are simple, wooden and uncushioned. The stained glass windows depict scenes from the life of Christ, from the Nativity to the Ascension. The apse is also simple, with a Lady altar on one side and a saint on the other. The altar is marble. Behind the altar, against the rear wall, is a crucifix, placed within a peaked construct of marble and wood. The ceiling of the chapel has a very shallow pitch and is plaster, crossed by flat wooden beams.

The Fellowship Hall structure proposed to be demolished is in fair to poor condition. It is of wood frame construction covered by plaster, with a side-gabled roof. A modern wooden addition has been attached to the front of the structure. Although the main part of the structure was built circa 1920s, it is completely without ornament and lacks any historical significance.

The Church complex also includes a private residence, built circa 1920s. This structure was also built in the Spanish Colonial Revival style with Classical Revival elements. The front of the residence has two small upstairs balconies leading from French doors, surrounded by wrought iron fencing. The central upstairs window also has a decorative cage of wrought iron underneath. The front entryway consists of an arched recessed porch, flanked by two Corinthian columns. The lower story windows on either side of the

entryway are arched. In front of the house stand two brick walls containing domestic shrubs and plants. Overall, the structure is in good condition. This structure occupied this location prior to the construction of the church. The home was integrated into the church complex as a rectory.”

Proposed Construction

As part of the expansion of the complex, the church sanctuary building may add a second story extension, including a new roof over an exterior façade with three additional arched windows to the west side of the existing building, as well as both exterior and interior remodeling of the first floor. The first floor remodeling would include partial demolition of the existing western and southern portion of the building and roof. The interior altar area would be replaced with a new altar shifted to the west so that the rear aligns with the exterior wall of the western area of the second story extension. Interior room partition walls adjacent to the existing altar area would be demolished to provide an open area for the installation of two hundred and fifty additional seats around the front and sides of the new altar platform. Six rows of existing seats would be relocated from the area near the east entrance of the church sanctuary building to the new area in front of the altar platform. This relocation would allow an expansion, to approximately double its current size, of the existing interior gathering space located adjacent to the east entrance. New exterior building materials, including roofing, would match the existing building.

On the first floor, the new school addition to the existing kindergarten building would include four new classrooms, some restrooms, and some storage areas. The second floor would include a library, a choir practice room, an office, and storage. The new building would be served by an elevator. New exterior building materials, including roofing, would match the existing kindergarten building. However, the new building’s windows and openings would be selected and designed to complement rather than replicate the existing building’s fenestration.

As proposed, the new school addition appears to cross an existing property line, which would create a violation of the building code. To avoid this situation, a lot line adjustment would be required prior to construction of this building.

Two new classrooms are proposed to be added to the west wing of the main school building. This one-story addition is minor and located away from the street. New exterior building materials, including roofing, windows, and doors would match the existing building addition constructed in 1957. A new covered walkway would also be added along the northern façade of the existing main school building.

The new two-story parish center would be located to the north of the existing office center, and would front on to the east side of Hyland Avenue. On the first floor, the building would contain a lounge, two conference rooms, a double-height multi-purpose room, a kitchen, restrooms, storage, and a double-height lobby adjacent to the entrance on Hyland Avenue. The second story would contain four conference rooms, some restrooms, a control booth for the multi-purpose room, storage, and a mechanical deck. The building facades would be stucco, with wood accent post features on selected building elements. A standing seam metal roof is proposed to cover the building. An exterior covered walkway would wrap around the southern and eastern portions of the building, and a landscaped courtyard would be located between the new parish center and the existing office center.

To accommodate the expansion of the complex, two existing structures, the barbecue pavilion and St. Francis fellowship hall building, are proposed to be demolished. According to the Historic Evaluation, the buildings scheduled for demolition do not appear to contribute to the significance of the complex as defined in the City of San Jose's Historic Evaluation form.

Compatibility

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation are ten basic principles created to help preserve the distinctive character of a historic building and its site, while allowing for reasonable change to meet new needs. The underlying concern expressed in the Standards is the preservation of significant historic materials and features of a building in the process of rehabilitation. The Standards are applied to projects in a reasonable manner, taking into consideration economic and technical feasibility. The Standards (36 CFR Part 67) apply to historic buildings of all periods, styles, types, materials, and sizes. For the purposes of Historic Preservation in the City of San Jose, the Standards are applied to exterior work, not interior work. The Standards also encompass related landscape features and the building's site and environment as well as attached, adjacent, or related new construction.

The proposed project appears to comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The project will maintain the existing use of the subject site. By limiting the scope of demolition to minor structures that are not architecturally significant, the project preserves the historic character of the property. Additions and renovations to the existing buildings are intended to be compatible and not create a false sense of history.

The Historic Evaluation identified several changes to the original complex that occurred over time, including the addition of distinctive stained glass windows during the 1970s. The project will maintain these previously constructed significant changes to the maximum extent practicable.

The new parish center, a building that would not physically be connected to an existing building, would have similar proportions to the existing buildings in the complex, and would attempt to complement the existing complex in color and materials. However, the new parish center would be clearly distinguishable from the existing structures in the complex.

For the reasons mentioned above, staff believes that the proposed project is in conformance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, and is compatible in size, materials, and massing with the existing Saint John Vianney church complex.

Conclusion

The Saint John Vianney church complex is not currently listed on either the California Register of Historic Resources or the National Register of Historic Places, and, according to the Historic Evaluation completed by Archaeological Resource Management, the complex does not appear to be eligible for either register. The church is Spanish Colonial Revival in style, but it is not an especially fine or unusual example of this style. Although not historic, the stained glass windows, added in the 1970s, possess high artistic values.

The proposed project would not affect the historic integrity of the existing complex if the

remodeled and new structures are designed in a manner that is consistent with the architectural style of the existing structures. As currently shown in the proposed plans and elevations for the Planned Development zoning application, the project appears to meet this criterion.

RECOMMENDATION

Planning staff recommends that the Historic Landmarks Commission recommend approval of the proposed project with the following provision, as stated by the Historic Evaluation completed by Archaeological Resource Management, that future construction or renovation of the church complex be consistent with the existing architectural style.

The Landmarks Commission's recommendation and comments will be forwarded to the Planning Commission, scheduled to consider the project May 28, 2003, and City Council, scheduled to consider the project June 17, 2003.

c: Roman Catholic Welfare Corp. of San Jose and Roman Catholic Bishop of San Jose
Attn: Michael J. Mitchell, 900 Lafayette Street, Santa Clara, CA 95050

Jeffrey T. Berg, AIA, The Steinberg Group, 60 Pierce Avenue, San Jose CA 95110